

TEXAS PUBLIC POLICY FOUNDATION

2019-20  
**LEGISLATOR'S  
GUIDE**  
to the issues



**TEXAS PUBLIC POLICY**  
FOUNDATION

Copyright ©2018 by the Texas Public Policy Foundation

Permission to reprint in whole or in part is hereby granted, provided the Texas Public Policy Foundation and the author are properly cited.

The Texas Public Policy Foundation is a 501(c)3 non-profit, non-partisan research institute.

The Foundation's mission is to promote and defend liberty, personal responsibility, and free enterprise in Texas and the nation by educating and affecting policymakers and the Texas public policy debate with academically sound research and outreach.

Funded by thousands of individuals, foundations, and corporations, the Foundation does not accept government funds or contributions to influence the outcomes of its research.

The public is demanding a different direction for their government, and the Texas Public Policy Foundation is providing the ideas that enable policymakers to chart that new course.

TEXAS PUBLIC POLICY FOUNDATION  
901 Congress Ave., Austin, TX 78701  
(512) 472-2700 Phone (512) 472-2728 Fax  
[www.TexasPolicy.com](http://www.TexasPolicy.com)

# Resource Adequacy

## The Issue

Competition was introduced into the Texas electricity and telecommunications markets in the late 1990s. Unlike the telecommunications market that has seen increasing levels of deregulation, the electricity market has been subject to a steady assault of attempts to heap new regulations on the market. Many have succeeded. Nevertheless, the competitive Texas electricity market has proved all critics wrong by supplying a reliable, affordable supply of electricity since its inception in 2002.

One attack against the market was made through a series of forecasts in 2012 of diminishing resource adequacy. This set the stage for a push by generators and the Public Utility Commission of Texas (PUC) toward vastly increasing government intervention in the electricity market. However, a more accurate assessment of the data debunked the notion that Texas needs to adopt a capacity market with subsidies to generators as high as \$4 billion a year—on top of what Texans pay for electricity.

In May 2016, the Electric Reliability Council of Texas (ERCOT) forecast historically high levels of reserves: 18.2% for 2017 (as opposed to a 12.84% forecast in 2014), and 25.4% for 2018 (almost double the forecast made for that year in 2014). However, a series of coal plant retirements has substantially lowered forecasted reserve margins. The ERCOT December 2017 forecast projected a 9.3% reserve margin for 2018, with reserve margins of 11.7%, 11.8%, and 11.1% for 2019, 2020, and 2021, respectively.

Although these projections are all below ERCOT's target reserve margin of 13.75%, they still show that Texas should have enough electricity to meet demand for the next four years. Perhaps the biggest challenge the Texas electricity market will face during this period is keeping policymakers and the public on track with competition when supplies get tight and prices increase. All of this will be temporary, but some people start to panic when they see prices rising and want to turn to regulation.

As lawmakers deliberate this issue in 2019, the facts will show that Texas' competitive electricity market is working, and re-regulating the market by emulating East Coast capacity markets will bring harm, not good. The low electricity prices that Texas is still experiencing are the best evidence that Texas has an adequate supply of electricity; the law of supply and demand tells us the low prices are the result of excess supply over demand. If this summer that changes for a period, that is ok—that is how markets work. Higher temporary prices will encourage additional investment in generation, which will increase our reserves. Texas can ensure sufficient generation of electricity for years to come and improve reliability by letting competitors compete and reducing intervention in the market.

## The Facts

- Texans use about 350 million megawatt hours (MWh) of electricity a year; reliability issues involve perhaps only 1.5 million MWh, less than 0.05% of annual use.
- Peak use is slowing, diverging from economic growth because of market innovation in demand-response.
- Texas' competitive market is already maintaining resource adequacy and improving reliability, both on the supply and demand sides.
- No evidence shows capacity markets boost capacity; from 2007-11, capacity payments in PJM (the mid-Atlantic grid) funded about a 4% increase in generation

while generation in Texas' energy-only market grew about 12%.

- Moving toward a capacity market in Texas would result in an “electricity tax” on consumers—of up to \$3 billion annually if Texas completely abandons its competitive market. Payments from consumers through the tax would mainly be used to increase the profitability of electricity generators and Wall Street investment firms, not to fund new generation.

### Recommendations

- The PUC and ERCOT should not manipulate the operating reserve demand curve (ORDC) at the state or local levels to increase revenue for generators.
- The PUC should eliminate the high systemwide offer cap.
- The PUC and ERCOT should more closely evaluate the ability of current and potential market-driven demand response to handle peak load strains on the system.
- The Legislature should prohibit a capacity market in statute.
- The Legislature should reorient/eliminate the Independent Market Monitor and the regulation of market power abuse.
- The Legislature should reduce the PUC's excessive regulatory authority.
- The Legislature should make the Texas Renewable Portfolio Standard voluntary.
- Texas policymakers should eliminate state and local subsidies/abateements for renewable energy.

---

### Resources

[\*Report on the Capacity, Demand and Reserves in the ERCOT Region, 2017-2026\*](#) by the Electric Reliability Council of Texas (ERCOT) (May 2016).

[\*Debunking the Myth: Texas is Not Running out of Electricity--The Generators\*](#) by Bill Peacock, Texas Public Policy Foundation (Feb. 2014).

[\*Texas' Competitive Capacity Market\*](#) by Robert Michaels, Texas Public Policy Foundation (Jan. 2014).

[\*Electricity in Texas: Markets, not Manipulation\*](#) by Bill Peacock, Texas Public Policy Foundation (Jan. 2014).

[\*The Reliable Texas Electricity Market\*](#) by Bill Peacock, Texas Public Policy Foundation (Oct. 2013).

[\*Capacity Markets Represent a Bad Bargain for Texas Consumers\*](#) by Kathleen Hunker, Texas Public Policy Foundation (Oct. 2013).

[\*There and Back Again: The High Transition Costs of Electricity Regulation\*](#) by Kristin Cavin and Bill Peacock, Texas Public Policy Foundation (Oct. 2013).

[\*Competition is Working in the Texas Electricity Market\*](#) by Bill Peacock, Texas Public Policy Foundation (Sept. 2013).

[\*A Texas Capacity Market: The Push for Subsidies\*](#) by Kathleen Hunker, Texas Public Policy Foundation (Sept. 2013).

[\*Does Competitive Electricity Require Capacity Markets? The Texas Experience\*](#) by Andrew Kleit and Robert Michaels, Texas Public Policy Foundation (Feb. 2013).

## Experts

**Kara Belew**, *Senior Education Policy Advisor, Center for Innovation in Education*  
kbelew@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: State Budget, Taxes, Public Education Finance and Policy, Public Education Accountability

**Derek Cohen, Ph.D.**, *Director, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime*  
dcohen@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Juvenile Justice Reform, Victims' Rights, Overcriminalization, Constitutional Limitations on Corrections

**The Hon. Chuck DeVore**, *VP of National Initiatives; Senior Fellow for Fiscal Policy*  
cdevore@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Tax and Fiscal Policy, Elections, Foreign Affairs, Military Affairs, Energy and Environmental Policy

**Vance Ginn, Ph.D.**, *Director, Center for Economic Prosperity; Senior Economist*  
vginn@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: State Budget and Tax Reform, National and State Labor Market Trends, Tax and Expenditure Limits, Energy Markets and Policy

**Michael Haugen**, *Policy Analyst, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime*  
mhaugen@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Civil Forfeiture, Overcriminalization, Substance Abuse Policy

**The Hon. Talmadge Heflin**, *Director, Center for Fiscal Policy*  
theflin@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: State Budget and Taxation, Economic Stabilization Fund, Local Government Spending, Pension Reform, Federal Funds

**Haley Holik**, *Attorney, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime*  
hholik@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Juvenile Justice, Grand Jury Reform, Constitutional Limitations on Search and Seizure, Overcriminalization

**Marc Levin, Esq.**, *VP of Criminal Justice and Right on Crime*  
mlevin@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Adult Corrections, Juvenile Justice, Overcriminalization, Victim Empowerment and Restitution, Law Enforcement, School Discipline

**Thomas Lindsay, Ph.D.**, *Director, Center for Innovation in Education*  
tlindsay@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Higher Education, Culture Wars (Political correctness, cultural decline, etc.), America's Founding Principles, Online Learning, Federalism, Tenth Amendment, Interstate Compacts

**Brandon J. Logan, Ph. D.**, *Director, Center for Families & Children*  
blogan@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Child Welfare Policy, Foster Care, Adoption, Family Law, Parental Rights

**Bryan Mathew**, *Policy Analyst, Center for Local Governance*  
bmathew@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Local Economic Regulation, Local Economic Development, Municipal Annexation, Housing Affordability, Property Rights, Special Districts

**Stephanie Matthews, VP of Public Affairs**

smatthews@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Workforce Development, Charter Schools, School Choice, Virtual Learning

**Jennifer Minjarez, Policy Analyst, Center for Health Care Policy**

jminjarez@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Medicaid Reform, Mid-Level Providers, Medical and Dental Licensure Reform

**Bill Peacock, VP of Research**

bpeacock@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Electricity Markets and Renewable Energy, Insurance, Technology and Telecommunications, Tort Reform, Property Rights, Economic Development, Consumer Issues

**Randy Petersen, Senior Researcher, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime**

rpetersen@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Policing Policy, Diversion Programs, Civil Asset Forfeiture

**James Quintero, Director, Center for Local Governance**

jquintero@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Budgets, State and Local Spending, Debt, Taxes, Transparency, Pensions

**Kevin D. Roberts, Ph.D., Executive Director**

kroberts@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: K-12 Education Growth, Increasing Public School Efficiency, Education Choice, Higher Education, Tenth Amendment

**Emily Sass, Policy Analyst, Center for Innovation in Education**

esass@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: K-12 Education, Education Choice, School Finance, Civic Education, Charter Schools

**Deane Waldman, Ph.D., Director, Center for Health Care Policy**

dwaldman@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Health Care, Medicaid, Telemedicine, Scope of Practice, Regulatory Issues

**The Hon. Kathleen Hartnett White, Distinguished Senior Fellow-in-Residence; Director, Center for Energy & the Environment**

khwhite@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: EPA Regulation, Energy and Environmental Policy, Free Market Environmental Policies, Endangered Species Act, Water Rights

The Texas Public Policy Foundation is a 501(c)3 non-profit,  
non-partisan research institute.

The Foundation's mission is to promote and defend liberty,  
personal responsibility, and free enterprise in Texas and  
the nation by educating and affecting policymakers and  
the Texas public policy debate with academically  
sound research and outreach.

Funded by thousands of individuals, foundations, and  
corporations, the Foundation does not accept government  
funds or contributions to influence the  
outcomes of its research.

The public is demanding a different direction for their  
government, and the Texas Public Policy Foundation is  
providing the ideas that enable policymakers  
to chart that new course.



901 Congress Ave., Austin, Texas 78701 | 512.472.2700 phone 512.472.2728 fax  
[www.TexasPolicy.com](http://www.TexasPolicy.com)