

Copyright ©2018 by the Texas Public Policy Foundation

Permission to reprint in whole or in part is hereby granted, provided the Texas Public Policy Foundation and the author are properly cited.

The Texas Public Policy Foundation is a 501(c)3 non-profit, non-partisan research institute.

The Foundation's mission is to promote and defend liberty, personal responsibility, and free enterprise in Texas and the nation by educating and affecting policymakers and the Texas public policy debate with academically sound research and outreach.

Funded by thousands of individuals, foundations, and corporations, the Foundation does not accept government funds or contributions to influence the outcomes of its research.

The public is demanding a different direction for their government, and the Texas Public Policy Foundation is providing the ideas that enable policymakers to chart that new course.

TEXAS PUBLIC POLICY FOUNDATION 901 Congress Ave., Austin, TX 78701 (512) 472-2700 Phone (512) 472-2728 Fax www.TexasPolicy.com

# The California-zation of Texas: Tree-Cutting Ordinances

### The Issue

According to the Texas Chapter of the International Society of Arboriculture, about 50 Texas cities—including major population centers like Austin, Dallas, Houston, and San Antonio—have adopted burdensome regulations that restrict or prohibit a property owner's right to prune or remove trees on their land.

The city of Austin requires private landowners to request and receive the city's permission to remove any tree with a trunk diameter of 19 inches or more. Further, Austin forbids the removal of "heritage trees"—trees of particular species with diameters of 24 inches or more—unless the landowner can prove to the city that the tree is diseased, a fire safety risk, or that the tree prevents reasonable development of the land.

The city of West Lake Hills prohibits the removal of any tree except under certain specified conditions. Even when those conditions apply, a city inspector must give approval before trees can be removed to establish a fire safety buffer zone, to make way for new construction, to remove non-native invasive species trees or plants, or even to remove a dead or diseased tree.

Proponents of tree-cutting ordinances argue that the presence of trees can improve property values for the neighborhood as a whole: Trees mitigate flooding impacts, they improve air quality, and they reduce stormwater runoff. Additionally, it is argued that trees provide aesthetic or sentimental value, or that they are key to a community's self-conception. Supposedly, these communal benefits justify prohibiting the removal of privately owned trees.

But this approach to private property flips the Texas legal tradition on its head. Whatever societal benefits they may provide, trees on private property are not a collective resource to be communally managed. They are real property owned by the landowner.

The idea that private property rights include ownership of the natural resources contained within—including timber—dates back to the philosophical articulation of private property ownership itself. As John Locke wrote: "As much land as a man tills, plants, improves, cultivates, and can use the product of, so much is his property."

It is unjust for government to coerce a private owner to use their private property to provide a social benefit without compensation. The state of Texas has long understood this as an issue of justice—Article I, Section 17 of the Texas Constitution states: "No person's property shall be taken, damaged or destroyed for or applied to public use without adequate compensation being made."

If public benefits are being provided by trees on private property, and the public wants to continue to receive those benefits against the wishes of the landowner, then the public should pay for these benefits. Otherwise, property owners should be free to develop their land as they see fit—including trimming and removing all trees and timber.

# The Facts

- Approximately 50 Texas cities have adopted burdensome regulations that
  restrict or prohibit a property owner's right to prune or remove trees on their
  land, according to the Texas Chapter of the International Society of Arboriculture.
- It is generally recognized that private property rights include ownership of the natural resources contained with the land. As John Locke states in the *Second Treatise of Civil Government*: "As much land as a man tills, plants, improves, cultivates, and can use the product of, so much is his property."
- Article I, Section 17 of the Texas Constitution states "No person's property shall be taken, damaged or destroyed for or applied to public use without adequate compensation being made."

## <u>Recommendations</u>

- The Texas Legislature should prohibit local governments from restricting the trimming or removal of trees or timber located on a landowner's property.
- The Legislature should clarify that if a government forces unwanted trees to remain on private land, the government must provide adequate compensation.

### Resources

*Local Overregulation: Tree-Cutting Ordinances* by James Quintero, Texas Public Policy Foundation (May 2017).

Section 22.03.303, West Lake Hills Code of Ordinances.

# **Experts**

**Kara Belew,** Senior Education Policy Advisor, Center for Innovation in Education kbelew@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: State Budget, Taxes, Public Education Finance and Policy, Public Education Accountability

**Derek Cohen, Ph.D.,** Director, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime dcohen@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Juvenile Justice Reform, Victims' Rights, Overcriminalization, Constitutional Limitations on Corrections

**The Hon. Chuck DeVore,** VP of National Initiatives; Senior Fellow for Fiscal Policy cdevore@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Tax and Fiscal Policy, Elections, Foreign Affairs, Military Affairs, Energy and Environmental Policy

Vance Ginn, Ph.D., Director, Center for Economic Prosperity; Senior Economist vginn@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: State Budget and Tax Reform, National and State Labor Market Trends, Tax and Expenditure Limits, Energy Markets and Policy

Michael Haugen, Policy Analyst, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime mhaugen@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Civil Forfeiture, Overcriminalization, Substance Abuse Policy

**The Hon. Talmadge Heflin,** *Director, Center for Fiscal Policy* theflin@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: State Budget and Taxation, Economic Stabilization Fund, Local Government Spending, Pension Reform, Federal Funds

Haley Holik, Attorney, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime hholik@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Juvenile Justice, Grand Jury Reform, Constitutional Limitations on Search and Seizure, Overcriminalization

Marc Levin, Esq., VP of Criminal Justice and Right on Crime mlevin@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Adult Corrections, Juvenile Justice, Overcriminalization, Victim Empowerment and Restitution, Law Enforcement, School Discipline

**Thomas Lindsay, Ph.D.,** *Director, Center for Innovation in Education* tlindsay@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Higher Education, Culture Wars (Political correctness, cultural decline, etc.), America's Founding Principles, Online Learning, Federalism, Tenth Amendment, Interstate Compacts

**Brandon J. Logan, Ph. D.,** Director, Center for Families & Children blogan@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Child Welfare Policy, Foster Care, Adoption, Family Law, Parental Rights

**Bryan Mathew,** *Policy Analyst, Center for Local Governance* bmathew@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Local Economic Regulation, Local Economic Development, Municipal Annexation, Housing Affordability, Property Rights, Special Districts

#### 2019-20 LEGISLATOR'S GUIDE TO THE ISSUES

### **Stephanie Matthews.** VP of Public Affairs

smatthews@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Workforce Development, Charter Schools, School Choice, Virtual Learning

**Jennifer Minjarez,** Policy Analyst, Center for Health Care Policy jminjarez@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Medicaid Reform, Mid-Level Providers, Medical and Dental Licensure Reform

## Bill Peacock, VP of Research

bpeacock@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Electricity Markets and Renewable Energy, Insurance, Technology and Telecommunications, Tort Reform, Property Rights, Economic Development, Consumer Issues

**Randy Petersen,** Senior Researcher, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime rpetersen@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Policing Policy, Diversion Programs, Civil Asset Forfeiture

**James Quintero,** *Director, Center for Local Governance* jquintero@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Budgets, State and Local Spending, Debt, Taxes, Transparency, Pensions

### Kevin D. Roberts, Ph.D., Executive Director

kroberts@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: K-12 Education Growth, Increasing Public School Efficiency, Education Choice, Higher Education, Tenth Amendment

**Emily Sass,** Policy Analyst, Center for Innovation in Education esass@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: K-12 Education, Education Choice, School Finance, Civic Education, Charter Schools

**Deane Waldman, Ph.D.,** Director, Center for Health Care Policy dwaldman@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Health Care, Medicaid, Telemedicine, Scope of Practice, Regulatory Issues

The Hon. Kathleen Hartnett White, Distinguished Senior Fellow-in-Residence; Director, Center for Energy & the Environment khwhite@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: EPA Regulation, Energy and Environmental Policy, Free Market Environmental Policies, Endangered Species Act, Water Rights

The Texas Public Policy Foundation is a 501(c)3 non-profit, non-partisan research institute.

The Foundation's mission is to promote and defend liberty, personal responsibility, and free enterprise in Texas and the nation by educating and affecting policymakers and the Texas public policy debate with academically sound research and outreach.

Funded by thousands of individuals, foundations, and corporations, the Foundation does not accept government funds or contributions to influence the outcomes of its research.

The public is demanding a different direction for their government, and the Texas Public Policy Foundation is providing the ideas that enable policymakers to chart that new course.

