

TEXAS PUBLIC POLICY FOUNDATION

2019-20
**LEGISLATOR'S
GUIDE**
to the issues



TEXAS PUBLIC POLICY
FOUNDATION

Copyright ©2018 by the Texas Public Policy Foundation

Permission to reprint in whole or in part is hereby granted, provided the Texas Public Policy Foundation and the author are properly cited.

The Texas Public Policy Foundation is a 501(c)3 non-profit, non-partisan research institute.

The Foundation's mission is to promote and defend liberty, personal responsibility, and free enterprise in Texas and the nation by educating and affecting policymakers and the Texas public policy debate with academically sound research and outreach.

Funded by thousands of individuals, foundations, and corporations, the Foundation does not accept government funds or contributions to influence the outcomes of its research.

The public is demanding a different direction for their government, and the Texas Public Policy Foundation is providing the ideas that enable policymakers to chart that new course.

TEXAS PUBLIC POLICY FOUNDATION
901 Congress Ave., Austin, TX 78701
(512) 472-2700 Phone (512) 472-2728 Fax
www.TexasPolicy.com

Personal Income Tax

The Issue

Although no one likes to pay taxes, they are an inevitable part of funding government. A policymaker's challenge is to develop an efficient tax system providing necessary revenue while doing the least economic harm. A policymaker should note that not all methods of collecting taxes are created equal.

While each tax affects behavior differently, a personal income tax is among the most pernicious because of the negative effects it has on earnings, productivity, and wage gains. Because of these adverse effects, people are generally unable to save and consume as much as they would have otherwise.

What's more, a personal income tax requires a particularly large bureaucratic apparatus for tax collection purposes, much more so than for the collection of a sales tax. With more bureaucracy comes additional costs for taxpayers, resulting in higher taxes and fees.

No personal income tax is ideal for state lawmakers, as there are other ways to collect taxes without incurring such harmful economic effects or enlarging bureaucracy. And to its credit, Texas is one of only nine states without a personal income tax. While some argue that a broad-based personal income tax is needed to improve the state's overall outlook, this raises the question: How has Texas' economy performed without an income tax?

Texas' state and local tax burden ranks fifth lowest nationally, according to the Tax Foundation's latest [report](#), placing it among the best states for taxpayers. Because of the state's comparatively friendly tax environment, Texas' private sector economy has surged forward. For example, Texas' employers created the largest share of U.S. jobs with 25% of all civilian jobs created nationwide from December 2007 to December 2017. Given the best path to prosperity is a job, Texas is certainly doing something right.

[Research](#) also finds major differences among the nine states without a personal income tax compared to the nine with the highest marginal personal income tax rates and the 50-state average. The **Chart** on the following page shows that in every category examined, the states without a personal income tax performed better than those with the highest income tax rates and, except for gross state product, the U.S. averages, often by a wide margin.

Based on economic principles and empirical data, Texas' economic prospects for its residents are best served by the current low tax, pro-growth approach rather than a new personal income tax.

The Facts

- Texas is one of nine states without a personal income tax.
- Income taxes substantially damage a state's economy because they disincentivize savings, investment, productivity, job creation, and economic expansion.
- The nine states without a personal income tax outperformed the nine states with the highest marginal income tax rates and 50-state average in most economic areas from 2004 to 2014.

Nine States with the Lowest and Highest Marginal Personal Income Tax (PIT) Rates (10-Year Economic Performance)

	As of 1/1/2017	10-Year Growth				
		2006-2016				2004-2014
State	Top Marginal Earned PIT Rate†	Population	Employment	Personal Income	Gross State Product	State & Local Tax Revenue‡
Alaska	0.00%	9.9%	3.1%	48.8%	13.5%	135.1%
Florida	0.00%	13.5%	7.5%	34.2%	24.2%	22.9%
Nevada	0.00%	16.5%	9.1%	27.4%	14.9%	38.0%
South Dakota	0.00%	10.5%	4.5%	50.9%	48.0%	55.9%
Texas	0.00%	19.3%	17.6%	62.3%	48.6%	68.7%
Washington	0.00%	14.4%	9.2%	51.6%	48.3%	50.2%
Wyoming	0.00%	12.0%	5.2%	43.1%	15.9%	54.7%
New Hampshire§	0.00%	2.0%	2.9%	36.0%	29.9%	41.7%
Tennessee§	0.00%	9.2%	3.7%	43.8%	37.6%	34.6%
Average of 9 Zero Earned Income Tax Rate States*	0.00%	11.9%	7.0%	44.2%	31.2%	55.7%
50-State Average*	5.60%	7.9%	4.2%	41.0%	32.6%	51.3%
Average of 9 Highest Earned Income Tax Rate States*	10.31%	5.6%	3.6%	38.6%	32.9%	53.1%
Hawaii	8.25%	9.1%	6.9%	42.7%	35.2%	68.4%
Maryland	8.95%	6.9%	6.5%	35.1%	36.3%	50.6%
Vermont	8.95%	0.3%	-3.0%	36.6%	27.9%	51.9%
Minnesota	9.85%	6.9%	4.0%	41.4%	34.0%	58.5%
New Jersey	9.97%	3.3%	1.5%	32.3%	25.0%	45.7%
Maine	10.15%	0.6%	-0.8%	30.0%	22.7%	25.7%
Oregon	10.64%	11.5%	9.5%	44.7%	38.7%	55.4%
New York	12.70%	3.4%	0.5%	40.8%	38.0%	63.8%
California	13.30%	9.0%	7.6%	44.1%	38.5%	57.7%

*averages are equal-weighted

† Top Marginal PIT Rate is the top marginal rate on personal earned income imposed as of 1/1/2017 using the tax rate of each state's largest city as a proxy for the local tax. The deductibility of federal taxes from state tax liability is included where applicable.

‡ State & Local Tax Revenue is the 10-year growth in state and local tax revenue from the Census Bureau's State & Local Government Finances survey. Because of data release lag, these data are 2004 to 2014.

§ New Hampshire and Tennessee tax interest and dividend income—so-called "unearned" income—but not ordinary wage income. Tennessee's unearned income tax, the Hall Tax, is being phased out.

Source: Laffer Associates, U.S. Census Bureau, Bureau of Labor Statistics, Bureau of Economic Analysis

continued

Personal Income Tax (cont.)

Recommendations

- Never create a personal income tax in Texas.
- Encourage economic growth by keeping taxes low and adopting pro-growth reforms.

Resources

Do Institutions Matter for Prosperity in Texas and Beyond? by Vance Ginn, Texas Public Policy Foundation (Forthcoming).

[*Rich States, Poor States*](#) by Arthur B. Laffer, Stephen Moore, and Jonathan Williams, American Legislative Exchange Council (April 2017).

[*How Big Government Hurts the Economy*](#) by Chuck DeVore, Nicholas C. Drinkwater, Arthur B. Laffer, and Stephen Moore, Texas Public Policy Foundation (Nov. 2013).

Experts

Kara Belew, *Senior Education Policy Advisor, Center for Innovation in Education*
kbelew@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: State Budget, Taxes, Public Education Finance and Policy, Public Education Accountability

Derek Cohen, Ph.D., *Director, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime*
dcohen@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Juvenile Justice Reform, Victims' Rights, Overcriminalization, Constitutional Limitations on Corrections

The Hon. Chuck DeVore, *VP of National Initiatives; Senior Fellow for Fiscal Policy*
cdevore@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Tax and Fiscal Policy, Elections, Foreign Affairs, Military Affairs, Energy and Environmental Policy

Vance Ginn, Ph.D., *Director, Center for Economic Prosperity; Senior Economist*
vginn@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: State Budget and Tax Reform, National and State Labor Market Trends, Tax and Expenditure Limits, Energy Markets and Policy

Michael Haugen, *Policy Analyst, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime*
mhaugen@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Civil Forfeiture, Overcriminalization, Substance Abuse Policy

The Hon. Talmadge Heflin, *Director, Center for Fiscal Policy*
theflin@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: State Budget and Taxation, Economic Stabilization Fund, Local Government Spending, Pension Reform, Federal Funds

Haley Holik, *Attorney, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime*
hholik@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Juvenile Justice, Grand Jury Reform, Constitutional Limitations on Search and Seizure, Overcriminalization

Marc Levin, Esq., *VP of Criminal Justice and Right on Crime*
mlevin@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Adult Corrections, Juvenile Justice, Overcriminalization, Victim Empowerment and Restitution, Law Enforcement, School Discipline

Thomas Lindsay, Ph.D., *Director, Center for Innovation in Education*
tlindsay@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Higher Education, Culture Wars (Political correctness, cultural decline, etc.), America's Founding Principles, Online Learning, Federalism, Tenth Amendment, Interstate Compacts

Brandon J. Logan, Ph. D., *Director, Center for Families & Children*
blogan@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Child Welfare Policy, Foster Care, Adoption, Family Law, Parental Rights

Bryan Mathew, *Policy Analyst, Center for Local Governance*
bmathew@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Local Economic Regulation, Local Economic Development, Municipal Annexation, Housing Affordability, Property Rights, Special Districts

Stephanie Matthews, *VP of Public Affairs*

smatthews@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Workforce Development, Charter Schools, School Choice, Virtual Learning

Jennifer Minjarez, *Policy Analyst, Center for Health Care Policy*

jminjarez@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Medicaid Reform, Mid-Level Providers, Medical and Dental Licensure Reform

Bill Peacock, *VP of Research*

bpeacock@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Electricity Markets and Renewable Energy, Insurance, Technology and Telecommunications, Tort Reform, Property Rights, Economic Development, Consumer Issues

Randy Petersen, *Senior Researcher, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime*

rpetersen@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Policing Policy, Diversion Programs, Civil Asset Forfeiture

James Quintero, *Director, Center for Local Governance*

jquintero@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Budgets, State and Local Spending, Debt, Taxes, Transparency, Pensions

Kevin D. Roberts, Ph.D., *Executive Director*

kroberts@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: K-12 Education Growth, Increasing Public School Efficiency, Education Choice, Higher Education, Tenth Amendment

Emily Sass, *Policy Analyst, Center for Innovation in Education*

esass@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: K-12 Education, Education Choice, School Finance, Civic Education, Charter Schools

Deane Waldman, Ph.D., *Director, Center for Health Care Policy*

dwaldman@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Health Care, Medicaid, Telemedicine, Scope of Practice, Regulatory Issues

The Hon. Kathleen Hartnett White, *Distinguished Senior Fellow-in-Residence; Director, Center for Energy & the Environment*

khwhite@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: EPA Regulation, Energy and Environmental Policy, Free Market Environmental Policies, Endangered Species Act, Water Rights

The Texas Public Policy Foundation is a 501(c)3 non-profit,
non-partisan research institute.

The Foundation's mission is to promote and defend liberty,
personal responsibility, and free enterprise in Texas and
the nation by educating and affecting policymakers and
the Texas public policy debate with academically
sound research and outreach.

Funded by thousands of individuals, foundations, and
corporations, the Foundation does not accept government
funds or contributions to influence the
outcomes of its research.

The public is demanding a different direction for their
government, and the Texas Public Policy Foundation is
providing the ideas that enable policymakers
to chart that new course.



901 Congress Ave., Austin, Texas 78701 | 512.472.2700 phone 512.472.2728 fax
www.TexasPolicy.com