

Copyright ©2018 by the Texas Public Policy Foundation

Permission to reprint in whole or in part is hereby granted, provided the Texas Public Policy Foundation and the author are properly cited.

The Texas Public Policy Foundation is a 501(c)3 non-profit, non-partisan research institute.

The Foundation's mission is to promote and defend liberty, personal responsibility, and free enterprise in Texas and the nation by educating and affecting policymakers and the Texas public policy debate with academically sound research and outreach.

Funded by thousands of individuals, foundations, and corporations, the Foundation does not accept government funds or contributions to influence the outcomes of its research.

The public is demanding a different direction for their government, and the Texas Public Policy Foundation is providing the ideas that enable policymakers to chart that new course.

TEXAS PUBLIC POLICY FOUNDATION 901 Congress Ave., Austin, TX 78701 (512) 472-2700 Phone (512) 472-2728 Fax www.TexasPolicy.com

Margins Tax

The Issue

No matter how you evaluate Texas' business franchise tax, commonly called the "margins tax," it fails the least-burdensome-tax test and fails to allow Texans the opportunity to flourish. This broad-based, gross-receipts-style margins tax is far more complex and unique among all taxes nationwide—with only Nevada having a similar gross-receipts-style tax. Eliminating this onerous tax would best serve Texans.

Businesses do not pay taxes; people do, in the form of higher prices, lower wages, and fewer jobs available. Given taxes exist to fund only the preservation of liberty, the least burdensome taxes should fund conservative budgets that grow, if at all, by no more than population growth plus inflation.

The margins tax is inherently complex with multiple calculations to determine the lowest tax liability, two tax rates depending on business type, and the \$1 million gross revenue exemption. Complying with it is also markedly different from complying with the federal corporate income tax; as a consequence many firms must keep separate financial books. Because of these substantial costs, firms can spend more on compliance than their actual tax liability.

The 84th Texas Legislature <u>cut</u> the margins tax by \$2.6 billion by reducing the rates by 25% and raising the ceiling to file with the E-Z computation to \$20 million at a lower tax rate. This cut not only reduced the size of government, but employers also have more money to invest and hire workers.

Studies modeling the dynamic economic effects of phasing out or repealing the margins tax find substantial economic benefits, including thousands of net new private sector jobs and billions of dollars in net new personal income statewide.

The Foundation's <u>research</u> includes a dynamic economic model that accounts for burdens on the private sector of paying annual margins taxes and complying with the tax. The estimated results of full elimination of the margins tax within the first five years compared with the status quo include:

- More prosperity: Texas could gain \$16 billion in new inflation-adjusted total personal income.
- More jobs: Net new private sector nonfarm employment in Texas could increase by 129,200 jobs.

While eliminating the margins tax will enhance Texans' prosperity, the stakes are much higher than just one state. This transformational policy would make Texas a leader for America—and even the world—in tax policy. For example, this would allow Texas to join just South Dakota and Wyoming without a general business tax or individual income tax.

Getting rid of the margins tax should be done no matter the budget situation. While cutting the tax may result in a short-run drop in tax revenue, the associated dynamic increase in economic activity will likely generate additional tax revenue through other taxes that could replace some, if not all, of the drop. In addition, spending restraint will ease the path to elimination.

2019-20 LEGISLATOR'S GUIDE TO THE ISSUES

If immediately eliminating the margins tax is not possible, phasing out the tax over a couple of budget cycles would be a valuable alternative. Of course, phasing it out reduces the potential full economic gains because of the compliance costs that remain. If the phase-out option is chosen, lowering the tax rates for all firms is preferable to raising the revenue exemption threshold that forces the burden on fewer firms.

The Facts

- Texas' margins tax is complex, costly, and difficult to comply with, giving rise to a less competitive business tax climate, for which the Tax Foundation ranks Texas 13th overall and second worst in the corporate tax ranking.
- Texas does not have a revenue problem. Between the 2004-05 to 2018-19 budgets, the state's estimated total tax collections increase is 97%, much faster than the 63% increase in population growth and inflation.
- The margins tax fails to be a least burdensome tax and to allow Texans the opportunity to prosper.

Recommendations

- Eliminate the business margins tax. Potential budget surpluses, more tax revenue from new economic growth, and spending restraint should fund this without imposing a new tax.
- Pass a bill requiring a supermajority (two-thirds) vote of each chamber to raise taxes or implement a new tax.

Resources

<u>Texans Prosper from Eliminating Business Franchise Tax</u> by Vance Ginn, Texas Public Policy Foundation (April 2017).

Failure of Texas' Business Margin Tax by Talmadge Heflin and Vance Ginn, Texas Public Policy Foundation (Dec. 2015).

Economic Effects of Eliminating Texas' Business Margin Tax by Vance Ginn and Talmadge Heflin, Texas Public Policy Foundation (March 2015).

The Texas Margin Tax: A Failed Experiment by Scott Drenkard, Tax Foundation (Jan. 2015).

Experts

Kara Belew, Senior Education Policy Advisor, Center for Innovation in Education kbelew@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: State Budget, Taxes, Public Education Finance and Policy, Public Education Accountability

Derek Cohen, Ph.D., Director, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime dcohen@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Juvenile Justice Reform, Victims' Rights, Overcriminalization, Constitutional Limitations on Corrections

The Hon. Chuck DeVore, VP of National Initiatives; Senior Fellow for Fiscal Policy cdevore@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Tax and Fiscal Policy, Elections, Foreign Affairs, Military Affairs, Energy and Environmental Policy

Vance Ginn, Ph.D., Director, Center for Economic Prosperity; Senior Economist vginn@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: State Budget and Tax Reform, National and State Labor Market Trends, Tax and Expenditure Limits, Energy Markets and Policy

Michael Haugen, Policy Analyst, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime mhaugen@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Civil Forfeiture, Overcriminalization, Substance Abuse Policy

The Hon. Talmadge Heflin, *Director, Center for Fiscal Policy* theflin@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: State Budget and Taxation, Economic Stabilization Fund, Local Government Spending, Pension Reform, Federal Funds

Haley Holik, Attorney, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime hholik@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Juvenile Justice, Grand Jury Reform, Constitutional Limitations on Search and Seizure, Overcriminalization

Marc Levin, Esq., VP of Criminal Justice and Right on Crime mlevin@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Adult Corrections, Juvenile Justice, Overcriminalization, Victim Empowerment and Restitution, Law Enforcement, School Discipline

Thomas Lindsay, Ph.D., *Director, Center for Innovation in Education* tlindsay@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Higher Education, Culture Wars (Political correctness, cultural decline, etc.), America's Founding Principles, Online Learning, Federalism, Tenth Amendment, Interstate Compacts

Brandon J. Logan, Ph. D., Director, Center for Families & Children blogan@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Child Welfare Policy, Foster Care, Adoption, Family Law, Parental Rights

Bryan Mathew, *Policy Analyst, Center for Local Governance* bmathew@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Local Economic Regulation, Local Economic Development, Municipal Annexation, Housing Affordability, Property Rights, Special Districts

2019-20 LEGISLATOR'S GUIDE TO THE ISSUES

Stephanie Matthews. VP of Public Affairs

smatthews@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Workforce Development, Charter Schools, School Choice, Virtual Learning

Jennifer Minjarez, Policy Analyst, Center for Health Care Policy jminjarez@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Medicaid Reform, Mid-Level Providers, Medical and Dental Licensure Reform

Bill Peacock, VP of Research

bpeacock@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Electricity Markets and Renewable Energy, Insurance, Technology and Telecommunications, Tort Reform, Property Rights, Economic Development, Consumer Issues

Randy Petersen, Senior Researcher, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime rpetersen@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Policing Policy, Diversion Programs, Civil Asset Forfeiture

James Quintero, *Director, Center for Local Governance* jquintero@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Budgets, State and Local Spending, Debt, Taxes, Transparency, Pensions

Kevin D. Roberts, Ph.D., Executive Director

kroberts@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: K-12 Education Growth, Increasing Public School Efficiency, Education Choice, Higher Education, Tenth Amendment

Emily Sass, Policy Analyst, Center for Innovation in Education esass@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: K-12 Education, Education Choice, School Finance, Civic Education, Charter Schools

Deane Waldman, Ph.D., Director, Center for Health Care Policy dwaldman@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Health Care, Medicaid, Telemedicine, Scope of Practice, Regulatory Issues

The Hon. Kathleen Hartnett White, Distinguished Senior Fellow-in-Residence; Director, Center for Energy & the Environment khwhite@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: EPA Regulation, Energy and Environmental Policy, Free Market Environmental Policies, Endangered Species Act, Water Rights

The Texas Public Policy Foundation is a 501(c)3 non-profit, non-partisan research institute.

The Foundation's mission is to promote and defend liberty, personal responsibility, and free enterprise in Texas and the nation by educating and affecting policymakers and the Texas public policy debate with academically sound research and outreach.

Funded by thousands of individuals, foundations, and corporations, the Foundation does not accept government funds or contributions to influence the outcomes of its research.

The public is demanding a different direction for their government, and the Texas Public Policy Foundation is providing the ideas that enable policymakers to chart that new course.

