

Copyright ©2018 by the Texas Public Policy Foundation

Permission to reprint in whole or in part is hereby granted, provided the Texas Public Policy Foundation and the author are properly cited.

The Texas Public Policy Foundation is a 501(c)3 non-profit, non-partisan research institute.

The Foundation's mission is to promote and defend liberty, personal responsibility, and free enterprise in Texas and the nation by educating and affecting policymakers and the Texas public policy debate with academically sound research and outreach.

Funded by thousands of individuals, foundations, and corporations, the Foundation does not accept government funds or contributions to influence the outcomes of its research.

The public is demanding a different direction for their government, and the Texas Public Policy Foundation is providing the ideas that enable policymakers to chart that new course.

TEXAS PUBLIC POLICY FOUNDATION 901 Congress Ave., Austin, TX 78701 (512) 472-2700 Phone (512) 472-2728 Fax www.TexasPolicy.com

Regulatory Takings

The Issue

In 1995, the Legislature passed the Texas Real Private Property Rights Preservation Act (RPPRPA), providing compensation to property owners for loss of value due to new regulations on land use. Authors sought a method of protection and a deterrent against local government regulations that would damage the value of someone's property. Unfortunately, the act exempts municipalities. Since cities, due to re-zoning activities, are the largest condemnors, this exemption practically renders the act ineffective.

Additionally, even when a condemnor is not a municipality, the condemnor does not have to compensate a private real property owner for the taking, unless a court decides that the land has been devalued by at least 25% of its original fair market value. This tells property owners to expect losses of almost a quarter of the value of their property due to regulatory impacts. For the last three legislative sessions, bills have been filed attempting to address some of the above issues. However, the bills have stalled in committee. The problems remain.

The Facts

- Article I, Section 17, of the Texas Constitution states, "No person's property shall be taken, damaged or destroyed for or applied to public use without adequate compensation being made, unless by the consent of such person."
- The RPPRPA does not apply this constitutional protection to actions by municipalities—like zoning—that result in a reduction of property value, i.e., a taking. Section 2007.003(a) exempts the actions of municipalities from the provisions of the act.
- The RPPRPA, in Section 2007.002, excludes from the compensation requirement any government action that reduces the market value of private property up to 25%.
- Texas case law also makes it very difficult for property owners to receive compensation for regulatory takings. The Texas Supreme Court has stated that property owners do not acquire a constitutionally protected vested right in property uses.
- Dallas opted to re-zone around Ross Avenue to increase the number of luxury condominiums and improve the aesthetic beauty of its eastern gateway to downtown. The practical effect was to prevent many of the property owners already working on Ross from continuing to operate their businesses. One operator was allowed to continue operating his auto body shop, but at a cost of close to \$100,000 in legal fees and property modifications. Another was sued by the city when he resisted and is being threatened with hundreds of thousands of dollars in fines.

Recommendations

- The Texas Real Private Property Rights Preservation Act should be amended to apply to municipalities.
- The numerical threshold of what qualifies as a taking under the act—a 25% reduction of the market value of the affected private real property—is an arbitrary number that should be reduced or eliminated.
- Condemnors should have the ability to issue waivers as an alternative to financial compensation. Those waivers should specifically mention which property rights are being reinstated per the waiver. Doing so will allow the waiver to "run with the land" for future owners, as well as prevent municipalities from spending more.

Resources

<u>Private Property Interrupted</u> by Kathleen Hunker, Texas Public Policy Foundation (July 2014).

"The Story of Texas Begins with Respecting Private Property" by Kathleen Hunker, *Austin American-Statesman* (July 29, 2014).

<u>Regulatory Takings: The Next Step in Protecting Property Rights in Texas</u> by Ryan Brannan, Jay Wiley, and Bill Peacock, Texas Public Policy Foundation (July 2010).

<u>Private Real Property Rights Preservation Act Guidelines</u>, Attorney General of Texas. Article 1, Section 17, Texas Constitution.

Article 1, Section 17, Texas Constitution.

Texas Real Private Property Rights Preservation Act.

City of University Park v. Benners, 485 S.W.2d 773 (Tex.1972).

Experts

Kara Belew, Senior Education Policy Advisor, Center for Innovation in Education kbelew@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: State Budget, Taxes, Public Education Finance and Policy, Public Education Accountability

Derek Cohen, Ph.D., Director, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime dcohen@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Juvenile Justice Reform, Victims' Rights, Overcriminalization, Constitutional Limitations on Corrections

The Hon. Chuck DeVore, VP of National Initiatives; Senior Fellow for Fiscal Policy cdevore@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Tax and Fiscal Policy, Elections, Foreign Affairs, Military Affairs, Energy and Environmental Policy

Vance Ginn, Ph.D., Director, Center for Economic Prosperity; Senior Economist vginn@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: State Budget and Tax Reform, National and State Labor Market Trends, Tax and Expenditure Limits, Energy Markets and Policy

Michael Haugen, Policy Analyst, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime mhaugen@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Civil Forfeiture, Overcriminalization, Substance Abuse Policy

The Hon. Talmadge Heflin, *Director, Center for Fiscal Policy* theflin@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: State Budget and Taxation, Economic Stabilization Fund, Local Government Spending, Pension Reform, Federal Funds

Haley Holik, Attorney, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime hholik@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Juvenile Justice, Grand Jury Reform, Constitutional Limitations on Search and Seizure, Overcriminalization

Marc Levin, Esq., VP of Criminal Justice and Right on Crime mlevin@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Adult Corrections, Juvenile Justice, Overcriminalization, Victim Empowerment and Restitution, Law Enforcement, School Discipline

Thomas Lindsay, Ph.D., *Director, Center for Innovation in Education* tlindsay@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Higher Education, Culture Wars (Political correctness, cultural decline, etc.), America's Founding Principles, Online Learning, Federalism, Tenth Amendment, Interstate Compacts

Brandon J. Logan, Ph. D., Director, Center for Families & Children blogan@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Child Welfare Policy, Foster Care, Adoption, Family Law, Parental Rights

Bryan Mathew, *Policy Analyst, Center for Local Governance* bmathew@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Local Economic Regulation, Local Economic Development, Municipal Annexation, Housing Affordability, Property Rights, Special Districts

2019-20 LEGISLATOR'S GUIDE TO THE ISSUES

Stephanie Matthews. VP of Public Affairs

smatthews@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Workforce Development, Charter Schools, School Choice, Virtual Learning

Jennifer Minjarez, Policy Analyst, Center for Health Care Policy jminjarez@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Medicaid Reform, Mid-Level Providers, Medical and Dental Licensure Reform

Bill Peacock, VP of Research

bpeacock@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Electricity Markets and Renewable Energy, Insurance, Technology and Telecommunications, Tort Reform, Property Rights, Economic Development, Consumer Issues

Randy Petersen, Senior Researcher, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime rpetersen@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Policing Policy, Diversion Programs, Civil Asset Forfeiture

James Quintero, *Director, Center for Local Governance* jquintero@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Budgets, State and Local Spending, Debt, Taxes, Transparency, Pensions

Kevin D. Roberts, Ph.D., Executive Director

kroberts@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: K-12 Education Growth, Increasing Public School Efficiency, Education Choice, Higher Education, Tenth Amendment

Emily Sass, Policy Analyst, Center for Innovation in Education esass@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: K-12 Education, Education Choice, School Finance, Civic Education, Charter Schools

Deane Waldman, Ph.D., Director, Center for Health Care Policy dwaldman@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Health Care, Medicaid, Telemedicine, Scope of Practice, Regulatory Issues

The Hon. Kathleen Hartnett White, Distinguished Senior Fellow-in-Residence; Director, Center for Energy & the Environment khwhite@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: EPA Regulation, Energy and Environmental Policy, Free Market Environmental Policies, Endangered Species Act, Water Rights

The Texas Public Policy Foundation is a 501(c)3 non-profit, non-partisan research institute.

The Foundation's mission is to promote and defend liberty, personal responsibility, and free enterprise in Texas and the nation by educating and affecting policymakers and the Texas public policy debate with academically sound research and outreach.

Funded by thousands of individuals, foundations, and corporations, the Foundation does not accept government funds or contributions to influence the outcomes of its research.

The public is demanding a different direction for their government, and the Texas Public Policy Foundation is providing the ideas that enable policymakers to chart that new course.

