TEXAS PUBLIC POLICY FOUNDATION


Copyright ©2018 by the Texas Public Policy Foundation
Permission to reprint in whole or in part is hereby granted, provided the Texas Public Policy Foundation and the author are properly cited.

The Texas Public Policy Foundation is a 501(c)3 non-profit, non-partisan research institute.

The Foundation's mission is to promote and defend liberty, personal responsibility, and free enterprise in Texas and the nation by educating and affecting policymakers and the Texas public policy debate with academically sound research and outreach.

Funded by thousands of individuals, foundations, and corporations, the Foundation does not accept government funds or contributions to influence the outcomes of its research.

The public is demanding a different direction for their government, and the Texas Public Policy Foundation is providing the ideas that enable policymakers to chart that new course.

## Tax and Expenditure Limit

## The Issue

Texas has done better economically and fiscally than most states for decades. However, an area needing improvement is consistently controlling the state's budget growth. Because government spending ultimately drives taxation, especially when Texas must balance its budget, limiting budget increases is essential for a competitive economy that supports prosperity.
The 2018-19 initially appropriated amount of about $\$ 217$ billion is up $75 \%$ since the 2004-05 budget. Comparatively, the key metric of population growth plus inflation compounded over time is up an estimated $63 \%$ during this period. Adjusting the total budget for this key metric shows that total budget growth is up 7.3\% above the pace of population growth plus inflation since the 2004-05 budget. This excessive increase has burdened Texans with higher taxes and fees to sustain elevated spending levels and slowed economic growth.
While historically the Legislature has occasionally passed conservative budgets that increase by no more than this key metric, Texas needs to keep costly past budget cycles from repeating. This can be accomplished by adopting a stronger state spending limit. The weaknesses of the current spending limit derives from:

- Not covering most of the budget. In Article VIII, Section 22(a) of the Texas Constitution, the only appropriations subject to the spending limit are those derived from "state tax revenues not dedicated by this constitution," which is about half of the 2018-19 total budget. By capping only half of the budget, the rest can grow unabated.
- Not providing a reliable indicator for the budget's growth rate. The Texas Constitution requires that the limit be based on the growth in the state's economy, which is statutorily identified as personal income growth. Research finds that this measure's instability leads to costly fiscal volatility and uncertainty.
- Not relying on actual measures of economic growth. Given that several groups submit estimates of personal income growth to the Legislative Budget Board in November before a regular legislative session for the next two fiscal years, the projections are for almost three years. The difficulty of predicting this growth rate leads to discrepancies between actual and projected.
Fortunately, the 2018-19 budget meets the needs of Texans while potentially achieving the historic milestone of two consecutive state budgets held below population growth plus inflation. Now is the time to strengthen the state's weak spending limit.
The following graph presents the budget adjusted for population growth plus inflation over time to consider what the budget would look like if the Legislature had implemented a spending limit based on this metric in 2003 and followed it from the 2004-05 to 2018-19 budgets. Taxpayers would be asked to support a substantially smaller budget of $\$ 202$ billion, $\$ 15$ billion less than the current two-year budget.


## The Facts

- Texas' total state budget growth is up an estimated 7.3\% above the compounded growth of population plus inflation since the 2004-05 budget.
- The current spending limit is weak because it excludes a majority of the budget, is based on the estimated growth of future personal income, and can be avoided rather easily by lawmakers.

Texas' Government Budget Growing Faster than Reformed TEL Since 2004-05


Source: Legislative Budget Board's Fiscal Size-Up and authors' calculations.
*indicates estimate

- The Texas Senate passed $\underline{\text { SB } 9}$ (85-R) that covered more than half of the budget, based the growth rate on population and inflation, and computed the growth rate with past and projected data.


## Recommendations

- Pass a conservative state spending limit that makes the following changes, where applicable, to Article VIII, Section 22(a) of the Texas Constitution and to Section 316 of the Government Code:
- Apply the limit to Texas' total government budget; and
- Base the limit on the lowest growth rate of the Census Bureau's measure of state population plus the Bureau of Labor Statistics' measure of inflation for the consumer price index for all items, the Bureau of Economic Analysis' measure of total state personal income, or the Bureau of Economic Analysis' measure of total gross state product for the two fiscal years immediately preceding a regular legislative session when the budget is adopted.
- Change Article VIII, Section 22(a), such that a supermajority vote of two-thirds of the membership in each chamber-instead of a simple majority-is required to exceed the spending limit.


## Resources

Texans Deserve a Conservative Spending Limit - Testimony before the House Appropriations Committee in support of HB 208 by Vance Ginn, Texas Public Policy Foundation (July 27, 2017).
Strengthening Texas' Appropriations Limit - Testimony before the Senate Finance Committee for SB 9 by Vance Ginn, Texas Public Policy Foundation (March 27, 2017).
TEL It Like It Is: Why Texas Needs Spending Limit Reform by Talmadge Heflin and Vance Ginn, Texas Public Policy Foundation (Dec. 2015).

## Experts

Kara Belew, Senior Education Policy Advisor, Center for Innovation in Education kbelew@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: State Budget, Taxes, Public Education Finance and Policy, Public Education Accountability

Derek Cohen, Ph.D., Director, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime dcohen@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Juvenile Justice Reform, Victims' Rights, Overcriminalization, Constitutional Limitations on Corrections

The Hon. Chuck DeVore, VP of National Initiatives; Senior Fellow for Fiscal Policy cdevore@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Tax and Fiscal Policy, Elections, Foreign Affairs, Military Affairs, Energy and Environmental Policy

Vance Ginn, Ph.D., Director, Center for Economic Prosperity; Senior Economist vginn@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: State Budget and Tax Reform, National and State Labor Market Trends, Tax and Expenditure Limits, Energy Markets and Policy

Michael Haugen, Policy Analyst, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime mhaugen@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Civil Forfeiture, Overcriminalization, Substance Abuse Policy

The Hon. Talmadge Heflin, Director, Center for Fiscal Policy theflin@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: State Budget and Taxation, Economic Stabilization Fund, Local Government Spending, Pension Reform, Federal Funds

Haley Holik, Attorney, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime hholik@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Juvenile Justice, Grand Jury Reform, Constitutional Limitations on Search and Seizure, Overcriminalization

Marc Levin, Esq., VP of Criminal Justice and Right on Crime mlevin@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Adult Corrections, Juvenile Justice, Overcriminalization, Victim Empowerment and Restitution, Law Enforcement, School Discipline

Thomas Lindsay, Ph.D., Director, Center for Innovation in Education tlindsay@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Higher Education, Culture Wars (Political correctness, cultural decline, etc.), America's Founding Principles, Online Learning, Federalism, Tenth Amendment, Interstate Compacts

Brandon J. Logan, Ph. D., Director, Center for Families \& Children blogan@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Child Welfare Policy, Foster Care, Adoption, Family Law, Parental Rights

Bryan Mathew, Policy Analyst, Center for Local Governance bmathew@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Local Economic Regulation, Local Economic Development, Municipal Annexation, Housing Affordability, Property Rights, Special Districts

Stephanie Matthews, VP of Public Affairs
smatthews@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Workforce Development, Charter Schools, School Choice, Virtual Learning

Jennifer Minjarez, Policy Analyst, Center for Health Care Policy jminjarez@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Medicaid Reform, Mid-Level Providers, Medical and Dental Licensure Reform

Bill Peacock, VP of Research
bpeacock@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Electricity Markets and Renewable Energy, Insurance, Technology and Telecommunications, Tort Reform, Property Rights, Economic Development, Consumer Issues

Randy Petersen, Senior Researcher, Center for Effective Justice and Right on Crime rpetersen@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Policing Policy, Diversion Programs, Civil Asset Forfeiture

James Quintero, Director, Center for Local Governance jquintero@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Budgets, State and Local Spending, Debt, Taxes, Transparency, Pensions

Kevin D. Roberts, Ph.D., Executive Director kroberts@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: K-12 Education Growth, Increasing Public School Efficiency, Education Choice, Higher Education, Tenth Amendment

Emily Sass, Policy Analyst, Center for Innovation in Education esass@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: K-12 Education, Education Choice, School Finance, Civic Education, Charter Schools

Deane Waldman, Ph.D., Director, Center for Health Care Policy dwaldman@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: Health Care, Medicaid, Telemedicine, Scope of Practice, Regulatory Issues

The Hon. Kathleen Hartnett White, Distinguished Senior Fellow-in-Residence; Director, Center for Energy \& the Environment khwhite@texaspolicy.com AREAS OF EXPERTISE: EPA Regulation, Energy and Environmental Policy, Free Market Environmental Policies, Endangered Species Act, Water Rights

The Texas Public Policy Foundation is a 501 (c)3 non-profit, non-partisan research institute.
The Foundation's mission is to promote and defend liberty, personal responsibility, and free enterprise in Texas and the nation by educating and affecting policymakers and the Texas public policy debate with academically sound research and outreach.

Funded by thousands of individuals, foundations, and corporations, the Foundation does not accept government
funds or contributions to influence the
outcomes of its research.
The public is demanding a different direction for their government, and the Texas Public Policy Foundation is providing the ideas that enable policymakers to chart that new course.

